

STATE OF MINNESOTA

DISTRICT COURT

COUNTY OF RAMSEY

SECOND JUDICIAL DISTRICT

Case Type: Civil Other/Ballot Omission

Declaratory Judgment

Bruce Clark, Peter Butler, and Ann Dolan,

Honorable Leonardo Castro

Petitioners,

Case No. 62-cv-19-857

v.

City of Saint Paul, Minnesota;

and

Shari Moore, in her official capacity
Saint Paul City Clerk;

and

**DECLARATION OF ELLEN
BIALES**

Joseph Mansky, in his official capacity
Ramsey County Elections Manager,

Respondents.

Ellen Biales, hereby states and declares as follows:

1. I have been employed by the City of Saint Paul for 15 years and have served in my current role as Administrative Programs Manager with the Public Works Department since 2015.
2. My job duties required me to be integrally involved in community discussions concerning organized collection and the implementation of organized collection.

3. There was a detailed and extensive communications and outreach campaign to educate the public about the process for implementing the new organized trash collection system which included multiple media and outreach channels. This included seven months of direct communications to households which began in March 2018 and continued through the launch of the program in October 2018.
4. During the month of May 2018, for the period the City was seeking cart size selection from residential households, Public Works staff received approximately 8,300 phone calls (approximately 11% of the total households involved in the transition). With 9 staff able to answer approximately 20-30 calls each per day, timely response to residents was not always possible. Wait times for a return call from our staff could be up to 2 weeks, if not longer. A continued high volume of calls and emails to the city as the program rolled out necessitated the addition of a call center to assist with communications—particularly related to cart delivery, removal of old carts, the switching of cart sizes, and billing and account information. Even with the assistance of a call center providing basic information to residents, and consortium haulers providing customer service and billing, city staff are still regularly fielding 1500 – 2000 calls a month on these topics to resolve resident issues.
5. Consortium garbage haulers have mixed capacity to handle a large number of phone calls from Saint Paul property owners. Some of our smaller haulers may employ only one to two people to answer phones and provide customer service. If residents were to have to switch service, the time committed to each of these calls

would, by necessity, need to be longer in order to get basic billing and service information.

6. A short time frame for responding to calls to switch service is not possible given the large numbers of residential households that would need to arrange for service. For example, if 74,000 households needed to set up service within the next 30 days, given an 8-hour work day and 20 business days within the month, the garbage haulers would need to be able to accommodate phone calls from 468 residents per hour (3,744 per day). Regardless of the number of customer service staff, this volume of calls would overwhelm any customer service system.
7. In addition to responding to resident calls to switch service, the garbage haulers would need to adjust their billing and accounting systems to accept new customers, develop new routes to collect from these customers, switch or label carts to identify their carts for their drivers, and communicate to residents their particular collection day according to new routes. Even with our organized transition, where all customer information was provided to haulers up front, these changes took several months to implement and communicate to residents. Creating new routes within established collection zones took 5 months alone. It took the City 8 weeks to physically deliver a garbage cart to each of the properties within the program utilizing our cart manufacturers' coordinated, established assembly and distribution system.
8. When switching from open collection to organized collection, residential households did not need to individually request service; they only needed to select

a cart size. If they did not select a cart size, the City would give them a medium cart or the same size cart they had utilized in the past.

9. When transitioning to OTC, each household was guaranteed trash service whether or not they responded to City surveys or requested a specific cart size. That will not be the case in going back to an open hauling system with one to one contacts between individual haulers and residential households. Instead, any household that cannot or does not arrange for service with a hauler will not have garbage service.

I declare under penalty of perjury that everything I have said in this declaration is true and correct.

Dated: 6/11/2019

Ellen Biales
Ellen Biales